



# Policy Development in the AFRINIC Region

Seun Ojedeji and Emile Milandou PDWG co-chairs

AFRINIC-20 - Djibouti

June 5 2014



#### **Policy Development Agenda**

Policy Development

Agenda Thu

11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- ► Policy Session 1: Thu, 5 June 2014, 11:00 12:30
  - ► The Policy Development Process
  - ► Status of policy proposals and proposals under discussion in AFRINIC
  - ► Summary of Recent mailing list discussions
  - ► Summary of proposal under discussion in other regions
- ► Policy Session 2: Thu, 5 June 2014, 14:00 15:30
  - ▶ Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation
  - ► Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01: AFRINIC Whois Database Update Process
  - ► Resource Policy Manual Status Report
  - ► Policy Implementation Report Status Report
- ► Policy Session 3: Thu, 5 June 2014, 16:00 17:30
  - Discussion on proposed modifications and enhancements to the PDP
  - ► Election of PDWG Co-chair 2014-2016
  - ► Policy Development Open Microphone



#### Policy Session 1: Thu, 5 June 2014, 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development

Agenda

1 nu 11:00 – 12:30

PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS

RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election ► The Policy Development Process

- Status of policy proposals and proposals under discussion in AFRINIC
- ► Summary of Recent mailing list discussions
- ► Summary of proposal under discussion in other regions



#### Introduction to the Policy Development Process

Policy Development

Agenda
Thu
11:00 – 12:30

PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)

List Discussion Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- ▶ Defined by policy AFPUB-2010-GEN-005
  - http://www.afrinic.net/en/community/
    policy-development/
    251-policy-development-process-in-theafrinic-service-region-afpub-2010-gen-005
- Summarised on web page: http://www.afrinic.net/ en/community/policy-development
- ▶ Principles of openness, transparency, fairness



#### Introduction to the Policy Development Process

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 – 12:30

PDP

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS

RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 - 17:30





Policy Development

Agenda
Thu

11:00 - 12:30

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

regions)

14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### Policy Development Working Group (PDWG)

 Resource Policy Discussion mailing list (RPD) is open to anybody

Subscribe https://lists.afrinic.net/
 mailman/listinfo.cgi/rpd

#### **Archives**

http://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd

- Public Policy Meetings are open to anybody
- Anybody who participates is considered a member
- ► Two co-chairs selected for staggered two-year terms
  - ► Emile Milandou, Q2 2012 Q2 2014
  - Seun Ojedeji, Q2 2013 Q2 2015



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu

11:00 – 12:30

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 - 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### **Submitting a proposal**

- Anyone can submit a proposal.
- submitted to the Resource Policy Discussion mailing list
- AfriNIC will provide administrative support and assist in drafting, if requested
- AfriNIC shall also provide relevant facts and statistics if requested



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu

11:00 – 12:30

Current Policy proposal overview

(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal
summary (Other

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 - 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### **Draft Policy**

- ► Posted to RPD mailing list
- ▶ Published on AFRINIC web site
- Must be available for review at least four weeks before then next public policy meeting
- Changes mat be made based on discussion
- Expires after one year, unless approved by the Board of Directors, or replaced by a new version.
- May be withdrawn by the author.



#### Policy Development

#### Agenda

Thu

11:00 – 12:30 PDP

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01

WHOIS RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### **Public Policy Meeting**

- Proposal is placed on agenda
- Agenda announced on RPD mailing list two weeks before meeting
- No changes allowed in the last week before the meeting
- ► PDWG chairs determine whether consensus is reached at the meeting
  - If no consensus, then back to the mailing list for further discussion, or author can submit a new version
  - ► This is implied, but not explicitly stated, in the PDP
- Minutes published within three weeks after the meeting



Policy Development

Agenda Thu

11:00 – 12:30

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 - 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### Last Call

- ▶ (If there was consensus at the Public Policy Meeting)
- Two-week last call on the mailing list
- ▶ PDWG chairs determine whether there is consensus based on the discussion at the meeting and the discussion during the last call.

#### **Approval**

- ▶ If there is consensus, PDWG chairs recommend the proposal to the Board for approval
- Report of discussions and feedback
- ► The draft policy shall be ratified by the AfriNIC Board of Directors



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 - 12:30

PDP

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion Proposal summary (Other

regions)

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### **Implementation**

- Adoption and implementation date is announced on the RPD mailing list
- ► Should be less than six months after the end of the last call



Policy Development

Agenda

11:00-12:30

PDP Current Policy proposal overview

(AFRINIC) List Discussion Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Thu
16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### **Conflict Resolution**

► There is a discussion and appeal process for people who disagree with decisions made by the chairs.

#### Varying the Process

▶ It is possible to vary the process in case of emergency.



## Status of policy proposals and policy under discussion in AFRINIC

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu

11:00 – 12:30 PDP Current Policy proposal overview

(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### AFPUB-2013-V6-001

Remove requirement to announce entire v6 block

AFPUB-2012-V4-001

Anycast Assignments in the AfriNIC region

**AFPUB-2012-DNS-001** 

No Reverse Unless Assigned

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001

Academic IPv4 Allocation

AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01

AFRINIC Whois Database Update Process



#### Status of AFPUB-2013-V6-001: Remove requirement to announce entire v6 block Status: Ratified by Board and Implemented by Staff

Policy Development

Agenda
Thu
11:00 – 12:30

PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)

List Discussion Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS
RPM Document

Thu 16:00-17:30

Policy

PDP Modification PDWG Election

- http://www.afrinic.net/en/community/ policy-development/policy-proposals/ 908-afpub-2013-v6-001-draft01
- ► The current IPv6 requirement to announce the allocation as a single aggregated block is interpreted to mean that the announcement of more-specific prefixes is not allowed.
- ► This proposal seeks to permit the announcement of more-specifics.
- ► This proposal does that by removing these words from the existing IPv6 policy:

The LIR should also plan to announce the allocation as a single aggregated block in the inter-domain routing system within twelve months.

This proposal has been ratified by AFRINIC board and implemented accordingly.



#### Status of AFPUB-2012-V4-001: Anycast Assignments in the AfriNIC region Status: Ratified by Board, yet to be implemented

Policy Development

Agenda
Thu
11:00 – 12:30

PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 – 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001-

DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- http://www.afrinic.net/en/community/
  policy-development/policy-proposals/
  701-anycast-assignments-in-the-afrinic-region
- Seeks to allow assignment of a PI IPv4 /24 prefix for use with anycast services and GPRS Roaming Exchange (GRX) services.
- Existing policies allow PI IPv4 /24 for critical infrastructure, but this proposal targets users that would not be classified as "critical infrastructure".
- ► Existing policies allow PI IPv4 /22 for end users, but this proposal targets users who do not need so much space.
- ▶ Implementation extension requested by staff



#### Status of AFPUB-2012-DNS-001: No Reverse Unless Assigned Status: Ratified by Board not yet implemented

Policy Development Agenda

Thu 11:00 - 12:30

PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)

List Discussion Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS
RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- http://www.afrinic.net/en/community/ policy-development/policy-proposals/ 700-no-reverse-unless-assigned
- Seeks to encourage LIRs and end users to register assignments and sub-allocations in the AFRINIC database.
- Existing policy AFPUB-2005-V4-001 *IPv4 Allocation Policy* already requires registration.
- ► This proposal adds an incentive to register, by refusing DNS reverse delegation for address space that has not been registered.
- ► This proposal has passed last call and has been ratified by the AFRINIC board
- Implementation extension requested by staff



#### Summary of AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Status: Policy Under Discussion

Policy Development

Agenda
Thu
11:00 – 12:30

PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)

List Discussion Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS
RPM Document

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

Policy

- http://www.afrinic.net/en/community/
  policy-development/policy-proposals/
  842-academic-ipv4-allocation-afpub-2013-gen001-draft-03-under-discussion
- ► This proposal makes it posible for Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) to obtain IPv4 address space without a detailed network plan, using a simple formula based on the number of staff and students.
- Calculate: full time students + full time employees + (part time students \* 0.5)
- ► The above number multiplied by a ratio between 5 and 10 gives the number of IPv4 addresses.
- ► The institution must also have a plan to provide IPv6 connectivity.





# Summary of AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01: AFRINIC Whois Database Update Process Status: Policy Under Discussion

Policy Development

Agenda
Thu
11:00 – 12:30

PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)

List Discussion Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- http://www.afrinic.net/en/community/
  policy-development/policy-proposals/
  1109-afrinic-whois-database-update-process
- ► This proposal provides emphasis the innacuracy of the AFRINIC whois database
- ► The proposal sets a process towards ensuring that AfriNIC whois database is updated
- AFRINIC staff should conduct a whois database information validation once a year or at the renewal of resources
- ▶ IP resources be claimed back from the member if no response was received after one year of commencing the validation process of the member.



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview

(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 – 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS
RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

# 1. Issue: Scrutiny and Requesting too much "details" on Large Requests:

An issue was raised at the last meeting (in Abidjan) as to why AFRINIC seems to take a longer time on large requests for IPv4 addresses. Some listers stated that it is OK for AFRINIC to apply greater scrutiny on big requests to minimise fraud, and this will of course take more time. It was pointed out that this is a common business practice in most service industries.



should be denied altogether.

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 – 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS
RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election 2. Issue: Out of Region IPv4 Address Usage:

It was noted that as a recommendation, AFRINIC should also apply scrutiny on requests that originate from any off-shore registered company, as this is usually the first sign of possible fraud to take the IP addresses outside the region. Some suggestions were that such registrations

reservations mechanism and adopt the Sparse
Allocation (or bisection mechanism. (Owen DeLong
- is present, he can talk more about this).
It was observed that APNIC and other RIRs have already
switched to this allocation mechanism as it provides a
much better (and easier to understand) framework for

3. Issue: AFRINIC should move away from /29 IPv6



Policy Development

Agenda

11:00 - 12:30 PDP

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other

regions)

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Thu
16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election allocating/assigning IPv6 addresses than the mechanism in place.

4. Issue: AFRINIC does not have a policy for mergers, acquisitions and resource transfers

The poster pointed out that the current document on handling mergers, acquisitions and resource transfers that AFRINIC uses has never gone through the PDP and is therefore not a policy. He wondered if changes are need to that document, if they should go through the PDP (since it never went there in the first place).



**Policy** Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 - 12:30 PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

List Discussion Proposal

summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 - 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation Thu

16:00 - 17:30 PDP

Modification PDWG Election Onen Microphone 5. Issue: Clarification on the correct values of the country attribute when registering IPv4 addresses in the whois database

This was a request for clarification to establish what values should be in the country attribute.:

- 1 Where infrastructure is located
- 2 Where a customer themselves choses to be represented
- 3 Where a member organisation is legally incorporated.

It was pointed out by AFRINIC that this would be where the infrastructure consuming the IP addresses is located and if customers are involved, where these customers are located.



Policy Development

Agenda

0....

Thu 11:00 – 12:30 PDP

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001-

DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election 6. Issue: Define policy that stipulates where IPv4 space will be used (out/in-region)

This was in response to an inquiry about a /12 that was issued by AFRINIC to a member that is clearly using it out of the region, and wondered how it was done.

- 1 Discussions moved towards the need for a policy that would restrict space from being used out of the region.
- 2 It was a feeling that if a policy restricts out of region use, it may limit African organisations from growing their businesses outside Africa.
- 3 It was however noted too that before space is issued, it should be established that these entities are indeed African, not foreign (for example, off-shore organisations).
- 4 Others pointed out that IPv4 is no longer sustainable, and the region should look at moving to IPv6 rather than cling onto a dying set of resources.





Policy Development

Agenda

Thu

11:00 – 12:30 PDP Current Policy

proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other

regions) Thu

14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013GEN-001

Academic IPv4

AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01

WHOIS

RPM Document
Policy
Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### 7. Issue: WHOIS database update policy

A proposal was received from Jean Robert Hountomey suggesting a process for AFRINIC to maintain member contacts in the whois database as accurate as possible, due to the fact that this data keeps changing due to contacts leaving organisations or shifting roles.

- 1 Timelines on the cleanup were requested, so that there is progress measurement
- 2 Status of the activity that AFRINIC has been doing internally was requested, which AFRINIC shared and published.
- **3** AFRINIC stated that the activity did not yield expected progress, hence request to reintroduce it through policy.



**Policy** 

#### Summary of proposals under discussion in other regions

Development Agenda

Thu

11:00 - 12:30PDP

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu

14:00 - 15:30 AFPUB-2013-

GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS

RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 - 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election Open Microphone **ARIN** APNIC RIPE **LACNIC** 



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu

11:00 – 12:30 PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other

summary (Other regions)

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4

Thu

Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Implementation

Thu 16:00-17:30

ARIN Proposal	Purpose
address use	Current policy does not clearly state to what extent IPv4 addresses can be used outside the ARIN region. This proposal sets the guidelines and framework for that.



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Implementation

16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### ARIN Proposal

Remove minimum size of IPv4 block that can be transferred

#### Purpose

Policy currently sets the minimum block size allowed to be transferred a /24. In a post-exhaustion world, policy should allow and enable networks to move blocks around as they see fit, without arbitrary regulation of a minimum size.



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu

11:00 – 12:30 PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other

summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 - 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### ARIN Proposal

### oosal Purpose

#### Improved Registry Accuracy Proposal

# Proposal aims at clearly defining the services that are offered to legacy resource holders and include services like RPKI, Corporate name changes, etc to Contracted Legacy Resource Holders, in order to keep registry whois data

accurate.



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 - 12:30

PDP
Current Policy

proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other

regions)

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS

RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election Allow inter RIR ASN

ARIN Proposal

Purpose

Allow transfer of ASNs from APNIC to ARIN (and vice versa) since APNIC has a similar policy in place.



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu

11:00 – 12:30 PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

List Discussion Proposal summary (Other

summary (Other regions)

Thu

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS

RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### ARIN Proposal

Change utilization requirement for IPv4 space from last allocation usage to Total aggregate.

#### Purpose

Utilization requirements subsequent requests is calculated on a per allocation basis rather than in aggregate. For example, if an organization has  $4 \times /22$  and 3 of them are utilized 100 percent and the fourth utilized at 75 percent, that request would be denied. This is a bit out of balance as an organization with a single /20 utilized at 80 percent would have less efficient utilization but would be eligible to request additional space.



Policy Development There are no policy currently under discussion

Agenda

Thu 11:00 – 12:30

PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS
RPM Document

Policy Implementation

16:00 – 17:30





Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 - 12:30

PDP Current Policy proposal overview

proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other

regions)

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS

RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election Abandon minimum IPv4

RIPE Proposal

Remove restriction on the minimum size of IPv4 allocations and sub-allocations to LIRs.

Purpose



**Policy** Development

Agenda

Thu

11:00 - 12:30PDP Current Policy

proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other

regions) Thu

14:00 - 15:30 AFPUB-2013-**GEN-001** Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 - 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election Onen Microphone

RIPE Propo	sal
------------	-----

Allow IPv4 PI address transfers

Purpose

The current policy does not allow PI transfers, and this restriction is currently being removed. This avoids the situation where some members are selling ownership via side-letters or other means, rendering whois data incorrect/stale/false.



**Policy** Development

Agenda

Thu

11:00 - 12:30PDP Current Policy

proposal overview (AFRINIC)

List Discussion Proposal

summary (Other regions)

Thu

14:00 - 15:30 AFPUB-2013-**GEN-001** Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Thu 16:00 - 17:30

Policy Implementation

PDP Modification PDWG Election Onen Microphone

#### RIPE Proposal

#### Purpose

Remove multi-homing requirement for receiving an AS Number

Removes the requirement that a network must be multi-homed to receive an ASN. The current policy assumes that Autonomous Systems and their peerings are globally visible, and that they are

multi-homed with at least two

situations when one requires a

globally unique AS Number and

one or both of these assumptions

others. However, there are

are incorrect. イロン イ御ン イヨン イヨン ヨ



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 - 12:30

PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

List Discussion Proposal

summary (Other regions)

Thu

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### RIPE Proposal

#### Purpose

Remove IPv6 requirement to receive IPv4 space from final /8 To receive an allocation from the final /8, its required to have received an IPv6 allocation. This proposal removes the requirement.



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 - 12:30

PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

Proposal (Other

summary (Other regions)

Thu

14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

RIPE Proposal	Purpose
Inter RIR address transfers	Policy creates framework to transfer IPv4 addresses from one RIPE NCC to other regions and vice-versa.



#### **LACNIC** region: Policy proposals

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu

11:00 – 12:30 PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other

summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS
RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00-17:30

LACNIC Proposal	Purpose
Create an IPv4 reserve block for IPv6 deployment	Proposal to reserve a contiguous /14 IPv4 address block to be used exclusively by members who justify the need for IPv4 addresses for the immediate deployment of IPv6



#### **LACNIC** region: Policy proposals

Policy Development

Agenda

, igenia

Thu

11:00 – 12:30 PDP Current Policy proposal overview

(AFRINIC)
List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other

regions) Thu

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 - 17:30

LACNIC Proposal	Purpose
Management of returned resources	Proposal creates framework for managing resources returned from LACNIC members back to LACNIC or the National Internet Registries.



#### **LACNIC** region: Policy proposals

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu

11:00 – 12:30 PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

List Discussion
Proposal
summary (Other

summary (Oth regions)

Thu

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS

RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 - 17:30

LACNIC Proposal	Purpose
Inter RIR address transfers	Proposal allows transfer of address space (Ipv4) between RIRs and into/outside LACNIC in particular



### Policy Session 2: Thu, 5 June 2014, 14:00 – 15:30

#### Policy Development

Agenda

11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013GEN-001

Academic IPv4

AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01

WHOIS

RPM Document
Policy

Thu
16:00 – 17:30

- ▶ Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation
- Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01: AFRINIC Whois Database Update Process
- ► Resource Policy Manual Status Report
- ► Policy Implementation Report Status Report



# Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 – 12:30

PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

14:00 - 15:30 AFPUB-2013-

GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Thu
16:00 – 17:30

L6:00 – 17:30
PDP
Modification
PDWG Election
Open Microphone

Current version AFPUB-2013-GEN-001-DRAFT-03

http://www.afrinic.net/en/community/
policy-development/policy-proposals/
842-academic-ipv4-allocation-afpub-2013-gen001-draft-03-under-discussion

**Submission Date** 26 July 2013

Authors Andrew Alston, Sunday Folayan



### Summary of AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Status: Policy Under Discussion

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal
summary (Other

Thu 14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-

regions)

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- http://www.afrinic.net/en/community/
  policy-development/policy-proposals/
  842-academic-ipv4-allocation-afpub-2013-gen001-draft-03-under-discussion
- ► This proposal makes it posible for Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) to obtain IPv4 address space without a detailed network plan, using a simple formula based on the number of staff and students.
- ► Calculate: full time students + full time employees + (part time students \* 0.5)
- ► The above number multiplied by a ratio between 5 and 10 gives the number of IPv4 addresses.
- ► The institution must also have a plan to provide IPv6 connectivity.





### Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Differences between drafts (DRAFT-03)and (DRAFT-02)

Policy Development

Agenda Thu

11:00 – 12:30 PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion Proposal summary (Other

Thu 14:00 – 15:30

regions)

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-

DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30 PDP

PDP
Modification
PDWG Election

#### DRAFT-02

Change of the word Academic in item 3 and 3.1 to Higher Education Institutions

#### DRAFT-03

3) Proposal **Higher Education Institutions**qualify for IP address space
from AfriNIC based on the
sum of the number of
registered students and
employees on their campus.

3.1) To qualify for address space, **Higher Education Institutions** will need to apply as end users and provide the following documentation



## Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Differences between drafts (DRAFT-03)and (DRAFT-02)

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal
summary (Other

regions)

Thu
14:00 – 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS
RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu
16:00 – 17:30
PDP
Modification
PDWG Election

Open Microphone

DRAFT-02

Introduction of a new item to replace the existing 3.7 while the existing 3.7 is renumbered

DRAFT-03

3.7) While 3.5 defines a minimum ratio for which institutions shall be eligible, where an institution believes that it requires less space than defined by this ratio, a ratio of less than the default specified in 3.5 may be requested.



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu

11:00 – 12:30 PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

List Discussion
Proposal
summary (Other

summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-

GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

# 1 Summary of the Problem Being Addressed by this Policy Proposal

Given that the Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) in Africa are growing, and that Internet access within these Higher Education Institutions is critical to the educational experience of students, it is necessary to provide sufficient address space to these HEIs to allow them to function effectively. When we consider that such institutions are constantly upgrading their Infrastructure and bandwidth to support technologies which are severely limited in environments using Network Address Translation (NAT), we believe that it is important that HEIs desirous of public address space should have the ability to migrate away from NAT.



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal
summary (Other

Thu
14:00 - 15:30

regions)

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Thu
16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election Such migration will help promote technologies such as multicast and the convergence of voice and data networks, which will in turn drive down the costs within such institutions. By promoting the elimination of NATs, this proposal will also assist HEIs in their migration to IPv6, and in fact, to qualify under this proposal, dual-stack and/or rollout of IPv6 at the qualifying institution is mandatory.



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

Thu

14.00 – 15.30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

## **2** Summary of How this Proposal Addresses the Problem

- a This proposal will simplify the allocation of address space to HEIs by detailing and simplifying the address justification criteria
- b This proposal recognizes HEIs as end users, and removes the confusion previously seen where arguments have occurred as to the status of the applying institution.
- c This proposal helps to reduce the dependence of HEIs on NATs, and is in line with AfriNIC's own policy of not promoting the usage of such translation mechanisms..
- d This proposal encourages the adoption of IPv6 by making the rollout of IPv6 a criterion for qualification under this proposal.



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu

11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)

List Discussion
Proposal
summary (Other

regions)

14:00 - 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01

WHOIS RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

### 3 Proposal

Higher Education Institutions qualify for IP address space from AfriNIC based on the sum of the number of registered students and employees on their campus.

- **3.1** To qualify for address space, Higher Education institutions will need to apply as end users and provide the following documentation:
  - **3.1.1** Proof of Institution's registration/accreditation
  - **3.1.2** Proof of the number of registered full time students
  - **3.1.3** Proof of staff head count.
- 3.2 This policy applies a ratio to a head count of campus users, where the number of campus users is calculated using a formula of full time students + full time employees + (part time students \* 0.5)



#### Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Thu
16:00 – 17:30

- 3.3 In addition to the documentation specified in clause 3.1, institutions will need to provide details of planned/current IPv6 roll-outs, including committed time frames for the roll-out of IPv6.
- 3.4 For the purposes of this policy, the roll-out of IPv6 can only be considered to be a true IPv6 roll-out, if IPv6 is extended to the edge of the network, beyond just the core/server infrastructure.
- 3.5 Under the policy, HEI shall be eligible to receive IPv4 resources at a ratio not less than 5 IPv4 addresses per campus user, where campus user is defined in 3.2).



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion

List Discussion Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- 3.6 While 3.5 defines a minimum accepted ratio for which the justification is clearly defined in 3.1, applications based on a ratio as high as 10:1 shall be given due consideration and should be approved unless the justification for such increased ratio is believed by AfriNIC staff to be specious or fraudulent in nature.
- 3.7 While 3.5 defines a minimum ratio for which institutions shall be eligible, where an institution believes that it requires less space than defined by this ratio, a ratio of less than the default specified in 3.5 may be requested.
- 3.8 HEIs will be classified as End Users under this policy, on provision of a duly authorized letter from the institution management stating that address space allocated will not be used outside of the campus/academic environment.



#### Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 – 12:30

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- **3.9** HEIs qualifying under this proposal will qualify for the same academic discounts that are applicable to any academic institution at the time of application.
- 3.10 Since any HEI that has a large base of registered students and full time staff, has to, by the very nature of their function, have equipment on campus, this policy dispenses for the need for a HEI to provide detailed proof of equipment and infrastructure.



#### Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Summary of previous comments

#### Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-

GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- Many postings opposed codifying a ratio into policy. Let it be normal justified need, with network and utilization plans like any other applicant.
- Response that AFRINIC refused network plans before, hence the need for student to IP ratio for HEIs, and network plans do not easily justify concurrency.
- Some posters wondered why this proposal is particular to HEIs and why it cannot also apply to hospitals, schools, etc. The policy needs to take other types of institutions into account.
- ► Some suggestions to use NAT on the student devices were opposed.



#### Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Summary of previous comments

Policy Development

Agenda

11:00 – 12:30 PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

List Discussion Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 - 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001

Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS
RPM Document
Policy

Implementation
Thu
16:00 – 17:30

- Some suggested different ratios, such as 3:1 or 4:1, instead of the 5 IP addresses per student in this proposal.
- ► Some suggestions that the high 5:1 ratio applies to richer HEIs in South Africa, which does not reflect the situation Africa-wide.
- ► Some posters felt the proposal may likely be abused by HEIs submitting optimistic student numbers, others felt not.
- Comment that universities may start hoarding IP addresses if they qualify for much more than they really need.



## Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Summary of comments after AFRINIC 18

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal
summary (Other
regions)

Thu 14:00 - 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- Some posters says the policy will only be regionally beneficial and that a policy with fair distribution across Africa will be preferred.
- Other posters indicated that seeing the proposal as being regional does not apply and that the origin of the proposal authors tells it all
- ► Some say other ways to get academic IP resource users to move to v6 be sought while others indicate that the proposal is indeed addressing such effort
- ► Some say allocation of IP resources for HEIs who wish to apply using this policy should be done in phases



## Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Summary of comments after AFRINIC 18

#### Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

Thu

14.00 – 15.30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- Some also indicated that this policy will not make AFRINIC financially sustainable, while there were responses that AFRINC management should worry about doing what they have to do to make the organization sustainable financially
- Also others noted that some of the recommendation made to the authors that could make the proposal acceptable are taken in an opposing manner by the authors
- Most of the previous comments before AFRINC 18 were also re-echoed on the mailing list during the last call period.



## Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Summary of comments during and after AFRINIC 19

Development Agenda

Agena

Thu 11:00 - 12:30

PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election Some posters says the policy will only be regionally beneficial and that a policy with fair distribution across Africa will be preferred.



## Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Summary of proposal since AFRINIC 18

Policy Development

Agenda Thu

11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Thu
16:00 – 17:30

Policy

- ► The proposal received consensus to be move to last call during the PDP meeting at AFRINIC 18.
- ► The proposal did not receive consensus to be move to the next level in PDP during the last call period.
- ► The proposal was sent back to the list for further discussion and it was re-presented at AFRINIC 19.
- ► The proposal did not receive consensus to be moved to last call during AFRINIC 19, hence it was sent back to list for further discussion.
- No revision to the proposal has been made since AFRINIC 19



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 – 12:30

PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Thu 16:00-17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election Date of Assessment: 16 Nov 2013

1 How staff understands the proposal

This proposal details the criteria and justification that a higher education institution shall provide to AFRINIC when requesting for IPv4 address space. The proposal also makes provision of an IPv6 roll-out plan a mandatory criterion for higher education institution qualify to receive IPv4 space under this policy once ratified.



Policy Development

Agenda

Agenu

Thu

11:00 – 12:30 PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

List Discussion Proposal summary (Other

summary (Othoregions)

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### 2.A Staff Comments

- The proposal mentions "Higher Education institutions" and "Academic institutions" in two separate clauses. There should be a specific definition of such institutions (This has been handled in the draft 03 of the proposal).
- ▶ Section 3.9 (which is now 3.10) of this proposal is in contradiction with Sections 7.3 & 7.4 of the current IPv4 address allocation & assignment policy (afpub-2005-v4-001) by exempting applicants under this proposal to submit "documentation relating to the networks in question".



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election Section 2 (b) of the fees schedule states: "AFRINIC will apply a 50% discount to organizations which justify that they are official Academic or Research Institutions in their countries and demonstrate the exclusive use of assigned/allocated resources for not-for profit academic or research activities." Section 3.8(which is now 3.9) of the proposal will be superseded by the clause in Section 2(b) of the fees schedule.



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election ► Scope of Section 3.3 "details of planned/current IPv6 roll-outs, including committed time frames for the roll-out of IPv6".

- ► Should this check be enforced, say, when the HEI comes back for additional range of IPv4 addresses?
- Should information on the planned rollout be submitted in the IPv4 request or in a simultaneous IPv6 request?
- What should be the "committed time frame"? (Number of months?)



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 - 12:30

PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30

14:00 - 15:50

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-

AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### 2.B Legal Aspects

No significant legal issues on this proposal.



#### Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Discussion points

#### Policy Development

Agenda Thu

11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 - 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001

Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS
RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- ▶ Do Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) need multiple IP addresses per student?
- Can they qualify under existing policies?
- ► Even if they should qualify, is it difficult for them to persuade AFRINIC staff of their needs?
- ▶ If there is a problem, should it be addressed through policy, or through staff training?
- Will this proposal help?
- Will this proposal lead to abuse?
- ► If this proposal is generally on the right track, should the numbers be changed?



#### Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Summary of previous comments

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-

GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- Many postings opposed codifying a ratio into policy. Let it be normal justified need, with network and utilization plans like any other applicant.
- Response that AFRINIC refused network plans before, hence the need for student to IP ratio for HEIs, and network plans do not easily justify concurrency.
- Some posters wondered why this proposal is particular to HEIs and why it cannot also apply to hospitals, schools, etc. The policy needs to take other types of institutions into account.
- ► Some suggestions to use NAT on the student devices were opposed.



#### Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Summary of previous comments

#### Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

14:00 - 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Thu 16:00-17:30

Policy

- ▶ Some suggested different ratios, such as 3:1 or 4:1, instead of the 5 IP addresses per student in this proposal.
- Some suggestions that the high 5:1 ratio applies to richer HEIs in South Africa, which does not reflect the situation Africa-wide.
- Some posters felt the proposal may likely be abused by HEIs submitting optimistic student numbers, others felt not.
- Comment that universities may start hoarding IP addresses if they qualify for much more than they really need.



## Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Summary of comments during and after AFRINIC 19

Policy Development

Agenda Thu

11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal
summary (Other
regions)

Thu
14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013GEN-001

Academic IPv4

AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS

RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- Most of the comments made at the last public meeting were similar to previous comments.
- Some members says the policy will only be regionally beneficial and that a policy with fair distribution across Africa will be preferred.
- There has been low discussion of this policy on the mailing list since AFRINIC 19



#### Proposal AFPUB-2013-GEN-001: Academic IPv4 Allocation Discussion points

#### Policy Development

Agenda Thu

11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

Thu

14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- Do Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) need multiple IP addresses per student?
- Can they qualify under existing policies?
- ► Even if they should qualify, is it difficult for them to persuade AFRINIC staff of their needs?
- ▶ If there is a problem, should it be addressed through policy, or through staff training?
- Will this proposal help?
- Will this proposal lead to abuse?
- ► If this proposal is generally on the right track, should the numbers be changed?



# Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01: AFRINIC Whois Database Update Process

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 – 12:30

PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-

AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### **Current version**

AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01-DRAFT-01 http://www.afrinic.net/en/community/ policy-development/policy-proposals/ 1109-afrinic-whois-database-update-process

Submission Date 15 May 2014

Authors Jean-Robert Hountomey



# Summary of AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01: AFRINIC Whois Database Update Process Status: Policy Under Discussion

Policy Development

Agenda Thu

11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-

DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election http://www.afrinic.net/en/community/
policy-development/policy-proposals/
1109-afrinic-whois-database-update-process

- ► This proposal provides emphasis the innacuracy of the AFRINIC whois database
- ► The proposal sets a process towards ensuring that AfriNIC whois database is updated
- AFRINIC staff should conduct a whois database information validation once a year or at the renewal of resources
- ▶ IP resources be claimed back from the member if no response was received after one year of commencing the validation process of the member.



# Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01: AFRINIC Whois Database Update Process Text of the proposal (DRAFT-01)

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

Thu

14.00 – 15.30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

# 1 Summary of the Problem Being Addressed by this Policy Proposal

The African network infrastructure is growing with changes and extensions. This growth has brought changes in telecommunication and Internet infrastructure. With the emergence of new operators, mergers and acquisitions, the dynamism brought by the penetration of Internet technology has required organizational changes with job rotation. The need for accurate whois data has been in the news for years all over the world.



# Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01: AFRINIC Whois Database Update Process Text of the proposal (DRAFT-01)

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 – 12:30

PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01

WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election Inaccurate data is still present in the AFRINIC whois database because changes have occurred in organizations (point of contact, contact information etc.) and object owners have not updated their records. The result is a No response from whois contacts listed in the AFRINIC Database.



# Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01: AFRINIC Whois Database Update Process Text of the proposal (DRAFT-01)

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal
summary (Other

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS

regions)

RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election The goal of the proposal is setting a process towards ensuring that AfriNIC whois database is updated. A previous policy (AFPUB-2012-GEN-001-DRAFT-02: AFRINIC Whois Database Clean-up) was withdrawn by the Author after AFRINIC advised that there was already an internal process to handle the cleanup of whois data and do general contact update. However it has been noticed that objects in AfriNIC database are not accurate.



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 – 12:30

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion Proposal

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS

RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

### 2 Summary of How this Proposal Addresses the Problem

This proposal asks AFRINIC to maintain accuracy through a periodical database clean up. Furthermore, at least once a year or at the renewal of resources, AFRINIC staff should conduct a whois database information validation.



Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal

summary (Other regions)

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS

RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### 3 Proposal

AFRINIC members are committed through the RSA to maintain their data and keep it accurate. AfriNIC will then maintain accuracy of whois information through periodical database clean up or update. AFRINIC will periodically ask object owners in the Whois Database to actively check and update the accuracy of data in AfriNIC whois database

- 3.1 Cleanup
- **3.1.1** General Database Cleanup: At the ratification of this policy, AfriNIC staff will conduct a first cleanup by asking all POC present except those who received their objects in less than a year to confirm their POC information. We leave to AfriNIC staff the discretion to use any communication tool they find useful for this action.



Policy Development

Agenda Thu

11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

14:00 - 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01

Thu

RPM Document Policy Implementation

WHOIS

Thu
16:00 – 17:30
PDP
Modification
PDWG Election

Open Microphone

- **3.1.2** Annual Clean up: After the first cleanup, AfriNIC will conduct a cleanup once a year. We leave to AfriNIC's staff to define the period.
- **3.1.3** At the request of additional resources or services, AfriNIC staff will ask the organization to update its records.
- 3.2 If a change is requested by another policy: In case another AfriNIC policy made mandatory a change or introduce another object, the object owner is required to make this update. Steps:
  - 3.2.1 AFRINIC staff will ask members to confirm accuracy of their records in the Whois database in a months timeframe when contacted by email.
  - **3.2.3** After another month of unresponsive response, the record will be marked invalid.
  - 3.2.4 AfriNIC may publish publicly a report about number resources with invalid POC.





Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 – 12:30

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion Proposal

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 – 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001-

DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election 3.2.5 One year after the first contact initiation, if the data is still not accurate and the organization has failed to respond to the call to resolve the data inconsistency, AfriNIC may claim the number resources back.



### Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01: AFRINIC Whois Database Update Process 4.0 Situation within other RIRs

Policy Development

Agenda
Thu
11:00 – 12:30

PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01

RPM Document Policy Implementation

WHOIS

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### ARIN

ARIN conducts an annual POC (point of contact) validation process:

#### **APNIC**

there was a similar policy proposed that did not reach consensus and was withdrawn by the author. http://www.apnic.net/\_\_data/assets/file/0006/22857/prop-084-v002.txt

#### RIPE NCC

http://www.ripe.net/data-tools/support/clean-up-of-unreferenced-data

#### **LACNIC**

LACNIC obligates the resources holders contractually throught their RSA and reviews whois data when resources are requested and updates accordingly



### Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01: AFRINIC Whois Database Update Process Summary of comments received on mailing list

Policy Development Agenda

, igeniae

Thu 11:00 – 12:30 PDP

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion Proposal

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4

Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS
RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 - 17:30

- ► Some posters indicates certain words used in the proposal needs to change. Words like May to be changed to shall
- There were suggestion of introducing a grace period and different text were suggested
- ► The Author acknowledge to integrate comments in the draft accordingly.



## Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01: AFRINIC Whois Database Update Process Discussion points

Policy Development

Agenda

11:00 – 12:30 PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion Proposal summary (Other

Thu
14:00 – 15:30

regions)

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- ► Has there been experiences of invalid whois record?
  - Is there a problem this policy address?
  - If there is a problem, should it be addressed through policy, or through occasional whois clenaup by staff?
  - Will this proposal help?
- Will this proposal lead to abuse?
- ▶ If this proposal is generally on the right track, should the timing phases and/or penalties to defaulter be changed?



### Resource Policy Manual Status Report Summary of RPM document

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 – 12:30

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion Proposal summary (Other

regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS

RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- Proposed single document for all internet number resource policy information.
- Currently a draft, published at: http://www.afrinic.net/en/library/cfc/964-resourcepolicy-manual-draft?showall=1
- Initial draft has been compiled by AFRINIC staff.



### Resource Policy Manual Status Report Summary of RPM document

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)

List Discussion Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS

Policy Implementation

Thu
16:00 - 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

#### About the document

- No changes to existing policies have been made; proposals have only been combined into one document, for ease of lookup, referral and update.
- 2. All future policy proposals, after the implementation, will be reflected as changes to sections of the RPM.
- Policy proposal numbering remains unchanged. A policy proposal must state what section of the manual will be affected.
- **4.** All previous policy documents will be archived, for future reference.
- 5. The document is a simple reformatting of existing policy documents, and no content changes to the policies.
- The Board will approve the final draft and an announcement will be sent to the community.



### Resource Policy Manual Status Report Summary of RPM document

Policy Development

Agenda
Thu
11:00 – 12:30

PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Thu
14:00 - 15:30
AFPUB-2013GEN-001
Academic IPv4
AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01
WHOIS

RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

- **7.** RPM Update guidelines will be incorporated into the PDP where appropriate and published online.
- Milestones

Nov 2013 Presentation to the community - Completed

Jan 2014 Public call for comments on the draft - Completed

Mar 2013 Compilation of all comments received, incorporation of relevant edits - Completed

Apr 2014 Recommendation of final draft to the Board for approval - Completed

June 2014 Approval and Implementation - Will be done here?



#### **Policy Implementation Report**

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 - 12:30

PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

Proposal

summary (Other regions)

Thu 14:00 - 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS

RPM Document Policy

Implementation

Thu 16:00 - 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election External Document to be delivered by AFRINIC staff



#### Policy Session 3: Thu, 5 June 2014, 16:00 – 17:30

#### Policy Development

#### Agenda

Thu 11:00 – 12:30

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion

Proposal summary (Other regions)

#### regions) Thu

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- Discussion on proposed modifications and enhancements to the PDP
- ► Election of PDWG Co-chair 2014-2016
- ► Policy Development Open Microphone



#### Proposed PDP modification Emerging issues and discussion points

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 – 12:30

PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal
summary (Other
regions)

Thu 14:00 - 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document Policy

Thu
16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election

Open Microphone

#### 1 Concensus

There has been discussion within APNIC region about extending concensus base which could be interesting and useful to our community. Some of the topics include:

- a By what number of people in attendance represents the community in other to determine concensus. Do we set a minimum?
- b Can we explore the posibility of including remote paticipation to determine concensus? **e**-concensus (This is about to be tried within APNIC region)



#### **Proposed PDP modification Emerging issues and discussion points**

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 - 12:30PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

List Discussion Proposal summary (Other

regions)

Thu 14:00 - 15:30 AFPUB-2013-

GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 - 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election Open Microphone

#### 2 Emergency Clause on PDP

The following text is proposed to be introduced in the PDP to allow for proposals that require urgent to implemented in an expedited manner.

Clause " ... If urgently necessary pursuant to AfriNIC's mission, the Board of Directors may indicate that a policy needs to be treated as emergency. The Board will consult the Council of Elders and seek their approval about their intention to request an urgent consideration of a policy. The Council of Elders shall notify to the Chair of the Board their approval and this approval shall be made publicly available. The Recommended Draft Policy shall be sent to the rpd mailling list at least 7 days before the next next Public Policy Meeting for discussion and consideration..."



#### Proposed PDP modification Emerging issues and discussion points

Policy Development

Agenda

Thu 11:00 – 12:30

Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC) List Discussion Proposal summary (Other

regions) Thu
14:00 – 15:30

AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

- 3 Co-Chairs and Policy The current PDP does not explicitly indicate whether a Co-Chair can propose a policy. So the question to the community is should a co-chair be allowed by PDP to propose a policy?
- 4 Timeline for ratifying proposal There has been recent experience that proposal implementation could be delayed if the board does not ratify in due time. In view of this, staff has requested a modification for the policy implementation period to commence from board ratification date and not from last call(Sec 6.5 of PDP). Below are some options (but not limited to) for community consideration
  - a The 6 month implementation period is further extended
  - **b** A ratification deadline is set to enable staff implement
    - The implementation period is set to commence after board ratification





### Election of PDWG Co-Chair 2014 - 2016 PDWG Election Process

#### Policy Development

Agenda

regions)

Thu
11:00 – 12:30
PDP
Current Policy
proposal overview
(AFRINIC)
List Discussion
Proposal
summary (Other

# Thu 14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014GEN-001DRAFT-01 WHOIS RPM Document

Policy Implementation

Thu





- ► Emile Milandou's term ends now.
- ► Seun Ojedeji still serves for another year.
- ▶ A new Co-Chair is needed to serve a two-year term, starting just after this meeting.



#### **Policy Development Open Microphone**

Policy Development

Agenda

11:00 – 12:30 PDP Current Policy proposal overview (AFRINIC)

List Discussion Proposal summary (Other regions)

14:00 – 15:30 AFPUB-2013-GEN-001 Academic IPv4 AFPUB-2014-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 WHOIS

Thu

RPM Document Policy Implementation

Thu 16:00 – 17:30

PDP Modification PDWG Election This is your chance to discuss anything relating to AFRINIC number resource policies, including the policy development process.

- What works?
- What doesn't work?
- What should be changed?
- What new policies are needed?
- Please queue up at the microphones
- ▶ When it's your turn, state your name, and have your say